Scribal Publication, or the circulating of handwritten texts, played an important though little understood role in seventeenth-century New England. To the end of making this role more visible, I published a checklist of eighty-three such texts in the *Proceedings of the American Antiquarian Society* (115) in 2005, describing it as the fruit of ‘haphazard’ browsing in town and church histories and documentary collections and, for this reason, necessarily incomplete. The same method and the same sources have yielded another seventy texts described in the checklist that follows. Like its predecessor it excludes categories such as poetry (with two exceptions) and state-produced public documents (e.g., proclamations). In the meantime, I have essayed a narrative and analytical account of the practice in *Ways of Writing: The Practice and Politics of Text-Making in Seventeenth-Century New England*, where I also call attention to several major writers who limited themselves to this technology for the whole of their careers. Neither checklist incorporates all of the documents I mention in that chapter.


David D. Hall is Bartlett Research Professor of New England Church History, Harvard Divinity School.

Copyright © 2009 by American Antiquarian Society
Any estimates of the scale of scribal publication cannot be more than estimates. Too much has disappeared, including many of the manuscripts I cite in this second list. I have frequently relied, therefore, on references in letters, journals (above all, John Winthrop’s), and similar sources for information about texts that themselves seem irrecoverable. Nor can we do more than estimate the number of copies that circulated of any given text. Relatively few were reproduced in multiple copies by a scrivener. For others, a process that can be termed sequential copying is visible. As John Cotton remarked of a text of his that circulated in 1620s England, ‘Little did I think, that a private letter of mine written to a very friend, should ever have been divulged abroad. But it seemeth some got copies of it; and in process of time, one copy multiplied another.’ In keeping with Harold Love’s argument in *Scribal Publication in Seventeenth-Century England* (1992), I have included texts that may have existed only in a single version (copy? original?) that someone other than the writer (author) read. Cotton Mather’s ‘A Brand Pluck’d from the Burning’ (1692) is an example of the first; the single manuscript is in his hand, with interpolations and excisions marking it as a draft, and carries the notation on the cover ‘to be returned to the author.’ For some of the texts in this second list, the best evidence of their circulation rests on what the writer presumed as his or her readers or the existence of a copy in someone else’s handwriting.

Among the colonists, scribal publication was especially significant at moments of high controversy. As I noted in prefacing the previous list, the Antinomian controversy is a superb case in point, as are three others that erupted in the 1660s: the debates over baptism and church membership centered on the synod of 1662, the response of the Massachusetts government to the royal commissioners of 1664–1665, and the withdrawal of a group of parishioners from Boston First Church in 1669. Some years after

the fact, the founders of Third Church Boston assembled a documentary record of their struggle to become an independent congregation. It preserves a host of reports, petitions, letters, and exchanges that were circulating at the time. The magistrate Thomas Danforth filled a notebook with documents relating to the agitation about the commissioners, and the debates among the ministers in the 1660s about baptism spawned a dozen texts, four of which were printed at the time in London and Cambridge.

Scribal publication played a significant role as well in the intellectual life of the ministers and those close to them. When the ministers took on the challenge of defending their experimental system of church government to many English critics, they did so initially via this technology: hence the delayed publication of a text by Richard Mather (see #77) and Cotton's The Way of the Churches. Traces survive of the sharing of draft versions of theological treatises. Hooker brought the initial manuscript of ‘A Survey of the Summe of Church Discipline’ to a meeting of clergy in 1643 in the hope of having it vetted by his colleagues. The making of Thomas Shepard’s Theses Sabbaticae, a text printed in London in 1650, seems paradigmatic in this regard. In his ‘To the Reader’ Shepard described how, having preached on the meaning of the Sabbath to his Cambridge congregation, an audience that included the student body of Harvard College, he ‘reduce[d]’ the sermons ‘into certain theses’ for the benefit of these students. When some local ministers came upon this text, they asked for a longer version though also urging him to ‘take off some obscurity arising from the brevity and littleness of them.’ This task accomplished, Shepard’s colleagues urged him to send the expanded manuscript to London to be published, which indeed is what happened.

I invite corrections and additions, for the process of locating and describing texts of this kind is surely ongoing.

---

3. The Danforth notebook is described in Hall, Ways of Writing, 52, and is printed in Collections of the Massachusetts Historical Society, 2nd ser. 8 (1819): 46-112. Most of its contents are state papers and therefore are not listed here. The records relating to the Third Church controversy are noted below, checklist #60.
1. Salem church covenant (1629).

Preserved in sources other than the Salem church records proper; these are described in Williston Walker, *The Creeds and Platforms of Congregationalism* (New York, 1893), 93. A text employed in the forming of the congregation at Salem, when ‘Thirty Copies of the foresaid Confession of Faith and Covenant [were] . . . written out for the use of thirty persons who were to begin the Work.’ Nathaniel Morton, *New-Englands Memoriall* (Cambridge, 1669), 75. This event seems to have occurred anterior to July 20, 1629, when ‘every fit member’ elected Francis Higginson and Samuel Skelton as teacher and pastor, respectively. The contest among nineteenth-century antiquarians over the wording of this covenant is described in Walker, *Creeds and Platforms*, ch. 6.

2. John Winthrop, ‘sea journal’ (1630)

Manuscript, Massachusetts Historical Society (the journal); no independent copy seems to survive of the text he sent back to England. The entries in Winthrop’s journal-history beginning March 29, 1630, and ending June 14 constitute a day-by-day record of the Atlantic crossing he made on the *Arbella*. Winthrop intended these entries to be of benefit to others who would follow. Naming them a ‘journall’ or ‘relation,’ he sent a copy back to England and asked that other copies be distributed among supporters of the Massachusetts Bay Company, telling his son John in a letter of July 23 to ‘Take orders that a copy of my relation, etc. be sent to Sir Nath Barnardiston and my excuse of not writing to him, and Sir Wil Springe.’ Earlier, in a letter of July 16 he had told his wife Margaret, still in England, that he was sending her ‘the larger discourse of all thinges,’ possibly a different text and, if so, one that has not survived. *The Journal of John Winthrop 1630 to 1649*, ed. Richard S. Dunn, James Savage, and Laetitia Yeandle (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1996), xix–xxi (hereafter, Winthrop, *Journal*); *Winthrop Papers*, 6 vols. (Boston: Massachusetts Historical Society, 1928—), 2: 304, 306, 302.
3. William Brewster, ‘his testimony of this Bolton’ (1620s or earlier)


4. ‘Narrative concerning the settlement of New England’ (late 1630)

Manuscript, Public Record Office, London; recorded in *Calendar of State Papers, Colonial Series, 1574–1660*, ed. W. Noel Sainsbury (London, 1860), 111–12 (#77). Of unknown authorship, the ‘Narrative’ displays an awareness of early Plymouth history, the ‘great migration’ of 1630, and John Winthrop’s behavior under the difficult circumstances of those early months (he ‘fell to worke with his owne hands’). The writer also evokes ‘the Providence of God,’ instancing, among other events, the ‘destruction of the Indians above 60 miles along the Coast.’ The PRO copy is printed in *Proceedings of the Massachusetts Historical Society, 1st ser. 5* (1862): 129–31.

5. ‘Errors in Doctrine’ (1634 or 1635).

This text apparently survives only in Morton’s *New-Englands Memoriall*, where it is described as sent from the ‘Church of Boston to Church of Salem, for the reducing of Mr. Williams, and the erring part of the Church.’ As given by Morton, the title was ‘Errors in Doctrine maintained by some of the Brethren of the Church of Salem, tending to the disturbance of Religion and Peace in Family, Church and Commonwealth, viz. . . . .’ *New-Englands Memoriall*, 80–81. Arising out of the troubled ministry of Roger Williams in Salem; undated, but either 1634 or 1635.
5. John Pratt, an ‘Exposition’ or ‘Answer’ (1635).

A document Pratt, then a resident of New Town (Cambridge), wrote at the behest of the Massachusetts government as a means of undoing the damage done by a letter of his to an English correspondent reporting ‘thinges which were untrue & of ill report’ about the new settlements. Summarizing the letter to England in his journal, Winthrop noted that Pratt prepared an ‘Answer’ that he ‘gave . . . in writinge . . . this was deliuered under his owne hande & the handes of mr Hooker & some other of the minis ters.’ Copies of the ‘Answer’ were immediately dispatched to sympathizers in England. So we learn from Sir William Martin’s letter of March 29, 1636, to John Winthrop reporting having ‘received Prats exposition from Mr. [Emmanuel] Downing.’ Winthrop, Journal: 160–61; Winthrop Papers, 3: 240. Pratt’s statement was printed in Records of the Court of Assistants of the Colony of the Massachusetts Bay, 1630–1692, ed. John Noble and John F. Cronin 3 vols. (Boston, 1901–28) 2:109–12.

6. Thomas Dudley, ‘A paper of verses, describing the state of Europe in his time’ (1630s?)

Possibly written in England before Dudley’s emigration in 1630, but may date from c. 1640, for his daughter Anne (Dudley) Bradstreet alluded to her father’s poetry (specifically, ‘On the Four Parts of the World’) in ‘To her most Honoured Father Thomas Dudley Esq,’ a poem dated March 20, 1642. That Dudley was an active writer of verse—shared mainly within the family circle—is suggested by Cotton Mather’s remark in his ‘Life of Thomas Dudley’ (Proceedings of the Massachusetts Historical Society, 1st ser., 11 [1871], 221), ‘Mention is made by some of his relations of a paper of verses.’

7. John Cotton, statement of his reasons for emigrating (1634)

Manuscript, Hutchinson Papers, Massachusetts Archive, volume 240, a copy that was probably preserved by Cotton himself; but written in someone else’s hand. Dated December 3, 1634, this
letter to an unknown minister in England seems to have circulated widely, as Cotton probably wanted it to do. Thomas Hutchinson included it in *A collection of original papers relative to the history of the Colony of Massachusetts Bay* (Boston, 1769), 54–58, in Sargent Bush, Jr., *The Correspondence of John Cotton* (Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 2001), 181–88.

8. Richard Mather, ‘Arguments tending to prove the Removing from Old England to New, or some such like place, to be not only lawful, but also necessary for them that are not otherwise tyed, but free’ (1635).

This manuscript, which no longer survives, descended within the Mather family and was eventually printed in [Increase Mather], *Life and Death of... Richard Mather* (Cambridge, 1670), 12–19. According to Increase, his father’s ‘Arguments were thus presented to the Consideration of some godly Ministers, and other Christians in Lancashire, at several Meetings for that end’ (p. 19).

9. Francis Stiles, ‘Relation’ (1635)

No copy seems to survive of a ‘relation’ narrating the conflict that arose between two groups that converged in 1635 on the present-day site of Hartford and Windsor, Connecticut. Francis Stiles headed a group of twenty men dispatched to this area by Sir Richard Saltonstall. There they encountered people who, after founding Dorchester in Massachusetts, had decided to move to Connecticut. Saltonstall referred to this ‘relation’ in a letter to John Winthrop and, in another, mentioned an enclosure, probably this text. *Winthrop Papers* 3: 217–18, 229.

10. Narrative of Margaret Shepard’s death (probably soon after her death in February, 1636)

No copy may survive. Margaret, the wife of Thomas Shepard, arrived in Massachusetts with her husband and newborn son Thomas in October 1635. Debilitated by the voyage and the experience of childbirth, she died in New Town (soon to be renamed
Cambridge) 'a fortnight' after a new congregation was organized in the town (February 1, 1636). Too ill to participate in the ceremony, she was inducted into the church from her sickbed. A copy of her deathbed spiritual experiences, probably prepared by Thomas, came into the hands of Cotton Mather, who printed it in The Temple Opened (Boston, 1709), 30–31.

11. Phineas Pratt, 'A Declaration of the Afaires of the English People that first Inhabited New England' (1623 or more likely, much later)

Manuscript, probably in the Massachusetts Archives. Pratt came to New England in 1622 as a member of Thomas Weston's 'company.' Subsequently he lived in Plymouth and, much later, Charlestown. As narrated in this text, Pratt traveled to Plymouth in March 1623 to alert the colonists to the plight of Weston's men and a possible Native American conspiracy; as Edward Winslow noted in Good News from New England (London, 1624), Pratt also hoped that he 'might there remain, till things were better settled at the other Plantation.' He may have written this text in 1623, although a later date seems more probable, for in May 1662 the Massachusetts General Court awarded Pratt three hundred acres of land after he 'presented this Court with a narrative of the streights & hardships that the first planters of this colony under went in their endeavor to plant themselves at Plimoth.' Nathaniel B. Shurtleff, Records of the Governor and Company of the Colony of the Massachusetts Bay in New England, 6 vols. (Boston, 1850–54), 4 (Pt. 2): 56. Part of the narrative was printed in Increase Mather, A Relation Of the Troubles which have hapned in New-England (Boston, 1676), 17–20, where the nameless author is described as 'one of those that were employed by Mr. Weston.' The entire narrative was printed from the original manuscript in Collections of the Massachusetts Historical Society, 4th ser. 4 (1858): 474–87. Winslow, Good News, reprinted in Edward Arber, The Story of the Pilgrim

4. Not yet located.
12. John Winthrop, ‘Declaration’ (late 1636)

No copy survives of a text dating from the early stages of the Antinomian controversy. Winthrop shared this text with Thomas Shepard, who referred to it in a letter he wrote Winthrop (undated, but assigned by the editors of the *Winthrop Papers* to mid-December 1636). This and the succeeding document (no. 13) were, as Shepard put it, a ‘godly endeavour . . . to quiet and still those tumults . . . in the Churches concerning Justification by faith.’ Shepard urged Winthrop to ‘forbeare wrighting for a while’ and not to share the text with others. *Winthrop Papers* 3: 326–27.

13. John Winthrop, ‘Pacification’ (late 1636)

No copy survives. Alluded to in Shepard’s letter (see above, entry 12); *Winthrop Papers* 3: 326. Three of the ’7 Propositions’ it contained are described in Shepard’s response, 3: 327–32.

14. John Winthrop, response to John Wheelwright (October 1636?)

No copy seems to survive of a document Winthrop mentions in his journal: ‘A day or two after, the same brother wrote his mind fully, with such scriptures and arguments as came to hand, and sent it to Mr. Cotton.’ Winthrop, *Journal*, 197.

15. John Winthrop, ‘Christian Experience’ (December 1636/January 1637)

Manuscript, Henry Dunster notebook, Massachusetts Historical Society; printed in Robert C. Winthrop, *Life and Letters of John Winthrop* (second ed., Boston, 1869), 165–74. Another copy,
possibly derived from an original in Winthrop’s handwriting, survives in the Ezra Stiles Papers, Beinecke Library, Yale University; it was made in the late eighteenth century by Jonathan Trumbull (or his secretary) and given to Stiles, who noted in his diary that he had ‘recd a Letter from Gov. Trumbul with a Copy in one Sheet of the religious Experiences of the first Gov. Winthrop A. D. 1636 AE. 49.’ Robert C. Winthrop collated the two versions for his edition. The text is reprinted in Winthrop Papers, 3: 338–44. The Literary Diary of Ezra Stiles, ed. Franklin B. Dexter, 3 vols. (New York: Charles Scribner’s Sons, 1901), 3: 75. The stirrings of debate about the relationship between ‘free grace’ and ‘duties’ prompted Winthrop to write out this description of his spiritual progress.


No copy seems to survive. A text originating within the Antinomian controversy, as Cotton informed Baillie in The Way of the Churches in New England Cleared (London, 1648), 41: ‘The 3. thing thought needful for preparation to the Synod [of August 1637], was, to gather out of my Sermons to the people, and my conferences (in word and writing) with the Elders, all such opinions of mine as were conceived by some, to bee erroneous.’ The strong interest in what Cotton was saying in his sermons is indicated not only by this action but by the existence of other notes on a sermon about the ‘conditional promise’ that came into John Winthrop’s hands; these are printed in Winthrop Papers, 3: 351. See also number 28, below.

17. Henry Vane, ‘Mr. Vane’s expressions at Roxbury’ (1636/37)

Known only from a comment in a letter Thomas Hooker wrote Thomas Shepard requesting that he be sent ‘by the next messenger’ ‘A copy of Mr. Vane’s expressions at Roxbury,’ noting that ‘I have heard my brother Eliot [John Eliot, minister in Roxbury] is come about to this opinion; I have writ to him about it.’ Thomas Hutchinson, History of the Colony and Province of Massachusetts-Bay, ed.
18. John Wheelwright, ‘short writings to the Elders’ (1637)
   No copy seems to survive of a text John Cotton cited in a letter he wrote to the exiled Wheelwright (April 18, 1640) urging him to acknowledge the faults of tone and substance in his fast-day sermon of January 1637. Possibly the same as Wheelwright’s ‘Answer to the Elders’ in which he insisted that the ‘difference’ between him and them was ‘great.’ Bush, Correspondence of John Cotton, 309; Sargent Bush, Jr., ‘Revising what we have done amiss’: John Cotton and John Wheelwright, 1640,’ William and Mary Quarterly, 3d ser. 45 (1988): 745.

19. Various ministers, ‘Answer’ to John Wheelwright (1637)
   A text known only from Wheelwright’s allusion to it in A Briefe, and Plain Apologie (London, 1658), where he alleged that this text was ‘conceal[ed]’ from him until ‘one of the Magistrates . . . did procure a copy to be transcribed secretly in al haste, and sent it unto me.’ Sargent Bush, Jr., ‘John Wheelwright’s Forgotten Apology: The Last Word in the Antinomian Controversy,’ New England Quarterly 64 (1991): 31.

20. John Dod and twelve other ministers in England, ‘Reverend and Beloved’ (c. June 1637)
21. An ancient Record of the first New-England Synod, viz. at Cambridge, in 1637 (1637?)

Known to the collector-antiquarian Thomas Prince, who listed it among the manuscripts he used in writing *A Chronological History of New-England In the Form of Annals* (Boston, 1736), vii. Undoubtedly one of the copies made by John Higginson, who was hired by the Massachusetts government to make a record of the synod’s findings. His role as scribe and copyist is detailed in David D. Hall, *Ways of Writing: The Practice and Politics of Text-Making in Seventeenth-Century New England* (Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press, 2008), 64–65.

22. ‘the booke of the proceedings at the Court’ (late 1637?)

Referred to in a letter Hugh Peter wrote John Winthrop, Jr. in an undated letter but c. February 1638, this ‘booke’ was probably a record of the Massachusetts General Court session of November 1637 during which the Court fined, disfranchised, and exiled people who had supported Wheelwright and Hutchinson. Peter asked that, once ‘it is copyed out for your towne I must have agayne.’ He was living in Salem and Winthrop in nearby Ipswich. *Winthrop Papers* 4: 14. Possibly the doing of John Higginson, as I speculate in *Ways of Writing*, 65.

23. ‘The Examination of Mrs. Anne Hutchinson at the Court at Newtown’ (November, 1637).

No manuscript survives of the most famous of the texts emerging out of the Antinomian controversy. At the November session of the General Court, the magistrates, deputies, and ministers confronted Anne Hutchinson, questioning her for two days about the legitimacy of the private meetings at her home, her role as a spiritual teacher, and her criticism of some of the ministers. Out of this give-and-take came her spiritual autobiography centered on a ‘voice’ instructing her on whom to believe among the ministers. Thomas Hutchinson printed one version of this text as an appendix to *History of . . . Massachusetts Bay*, ed. Mayo, 2: 366–91.
A briefer version, but with material not in Thomas Hutchinson’s, was incorporated into *A Short Story of the Rise, reign, and ruine of the Antinomians* (London, 1644), 31–39.

24. Anne Hutchinson, ‘Recantation’ (early 1638, possibly March 15)

No copy seems to survive of a text ‘under her own hand’ that Hutchinson ‘presented . . . before the whole church’ (the Boston congregation) at some point in the church trial that took place in March 1638. According to John Cotton, the ‘recantation’ grew out of Hutchinson’s being ‘convinced . . . of her erroneous ways’ by John Davenport and himself. ‘Afterwards, when upon further serious debate and conference with her by Mr. Davenport, and myself, she was convinced of all her errors in particular, she being called again before the church, did openly recant every error and heresy.’ That copies were circulating is suggested by an allusion to a ‘recantation’ in a letter of Thomas Hooker’s to an unnamed correspondent, quoted in Hutchinson, *History of... Massachusetts Bay*, ed. Mayo, 1:63 (he also refers to ‘your relation,’ apparently a description of the church trial). Cotton, *Way... Cleared*, ed. Ziff, 252, 283.

25. Thomas Shepard and Thomas Weld, ‘divers Errors and unsound Opinions which she [Anne Hutchinson] held’ (early 1638)

The only surviving copy is preserved in an eighteenth-century transcription of the record of her trial (Ezra Stiles Papers, Yale University Library). The list was fashioned by two ministers who had met during the winter with Mrs. Hutchinson. It was introduced as evidence at the beginning of her ‘trial’ before the Boston church in March 1638. In the record of that trial, this collection of points is described as ‘taken from her owne Mouth . . . and proved by fuer Witnesses.’ The list is split between nine specified by Shepard and seven ‘from Roxberie.’ Recounting what seems to be this process of collecting her ‘errours,’ Thomas Weld expanded the list to twenty-nine, noting that ‘a coppy of them had been sent to her divers days before’ the beginning of the church trial. David D. Hall, *The Antinomian Controversy, 1636–1638: A*
26. John Davenport, ‘Profession of Faith’ (c. 1639?)
No manuscript copy seems to have survived of a fully written out ‘relation’ that may date from the organizing of the church in New Haven in early August 1639. Someone sent a copy to London, where it was printed as *The Profession Of The Faith Of That Reverend and worthy Divine Mr. J. D . . . Made publiquely before the Congregation at his Admission into one of the Churches of God in New-England* (London, 1642); from this source it is reprinted in *Letters of John Davenport Puritan Divine*, Isabel MacBeath Calder, ed. (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1937), 68–75.

27. Richard Mather, ‘Answer to Two and thirty questions’ (1639).
Manuscript, American Antiquarian Society (Mather Family Papers, Box 1, Folder 1). That copies circulated in manuscript is demonstrated by the publishing history of a copy that came into the hands of a London printer, who published it as one of three treatises included in *Church-Government and Church Covenant Discussed* (1643), unattributed but with a preface by Hugh Peter. The manuscript is headed, ‘An Apologie of the Churches of New England agst the excepting of Mr Richard Bernard.’ The legibility and precision of the AAS manuscript (corrections are very few) suggest that it was the doing of a professional scrivener, possibly Thomas Lechford, who about this time was making copies of a companion essay by John Davenport. One of a substantial number of books in which the colonists defended the ‘Congregational Way’ against its critics; See also Thomas J. Holmes, ‘Notes on Richard Mather’s ‘Church Government,’ London, 1643,’ *Proceedings of the American Antiquarian Society* 33 (1923): 291–96.

28. John Cotton, ‘sermon on Revelation’ (1639)
Manuscript, New England Historic Genealogical Society, found at the end of ‘The Confessions of Divers Propounded . . . ’ (also
known as the ‘Confessions of Thomas Shepard’). The sermons John Cotton was preaching in Boston in 1639–40 on chapters of the Book of Revelation intrigued his colleagues, some of whom continued to regard him with suspicion. Hence the provenance of a manuscript in Thomas Shepard’s handwriting, a copy he made of a summary of Cotton’s sermon on Revelation 4: 2. The sermon notes are transcribed in George Selement, ‘John Cotton’s Hidden Antinomianism: His Sermon on Revelation 4:1–2,’ New England Historical and Genealogical Register 129 (1975): 278–94; Shepard’s anxieties about Cotton were voiced in his autobiography; Michael McGiffert, God’s Plot: The Paradoxes of Puritan Piety (Amherst: University of Massachusetts Press, 1972), 74.

29. Jonathan Burr, ‘Judgment in the points in difference’ (1640?)

No copy survives of a text elicited from Burr, a minister who arrived in Massachusetts in 1639 and, soon thereafter, joined Richard Mather in the Dorchester pulpit. The two did not get along, especially once Mather let it be known that he suspected the younger man of ideas ‘savoring of familism.’ After Burr ‘wrote his judgment in the points in difference,’ Mather compiled a set of ‘errors’ he had ‘collected’ out of Burr’s sermons that John Winthrop describes as ‘published.’ A council of churches was called to reconcile the two men, a task facilitated by Burr’s ‘confessing that he was in the dark about these points’ until the ‘agitation’ he engendered ‘cleared them to him,’ and by Mather’s acknowledgment of poor judgment in not showing the ‘collections’ to Burr before distributing the document to others. Winthrop, Journal, 343–44. The episode is briefly narrated in Cotton Mather, Magnalia Christi Americana (1702; repr., Hartford, 1853–54), 1: 372–73, a sketch that seems to incorporate a third text.

30. ‘Propositions concerning Evidence of God’s Love’ (September 1640)

Manuscript, Winthrop Papers, Massachusetts Historical Society, a copy in John Winthrop’s hand. Another document associated
with the tensions between Burr and Mather. The eleven propositions, dated and signed by eight ministers who gathered in Roxbury, were meant to reconcile Burr and Mather. *Winthrop Papers* 4: 286–87.

31. John Winthrop, ‘To the Elders of the Massachusetts Churches’ (October, 1642)

Manuscript, Houghton Library, Harvard University, printed in Winthrop, *Life and Letters*, 2: 277–79 and in *Winthrop Papers* 4: 359–61. Growing out of the controversy about the ‘negative voice’ of the magistrates in the Massachusetts General Court and circulated, like other texts relating to this controversy, to the inner circle of political and religious leaders.

32. Darby Field, A ‘relation’ or ‘more exact relation’ (1642)

Known only from an entry in John Winthrop’s journal; the context implies a circle of readers. The relation summarized the exploration of interior New England undertaken by ‘One Darby Field, an Irishman.’ Winthrop described the ‘white hill,’ presumably Mt. Washington, that Field climbed during the trip and what Field saw after reaching the top. Someone, probably Field with help from others, prepared ‘another relation more true and exact’ than the ‘relation’ that initially came into Winthrop’s hands. Winthrop, *Journal*, 393–94.

33. Nathaniel Brisco, ‘A book against’ the taxing of non-church members (1643)

Known from an entry in Winthrop’s journal, where it is described as ‘published underhand,’ implying the production of copies or, alternatively, the circulation of a single exemplar. Either way, the ‘book . . . occasioned much stir’ in Watertown, where Brisco, a wealthy tanner who was not a member of the church, lived. The text came into the hands of a man living in Charlestown and was also read aloud in Watertown, a gesture that drew a fine from the Court of Assistants for ‘reading to diverses offensive passages . . . out of a booke, against the Officers,
34. Richard Bellingham (attributed to), ‘Answ: made to the Discourse about the Neg: vote’ (fall, 1643)

No copy survives of this response to Winthrop’s ‘Discourse’ of late 1642, but its contents can be reconstructed from Winthrop’s reply, printed in Winthrop Papers 4: 380–91. In his journal Winthrop attributed the text to ‘one of the magistrates, as was conceived,’ adding that ‘the deputies made great use of [the treatise] in this court.’ Winthrop, Journal, 456–57. That Bellingham, the most open critic among the magistrates of Winthrop’s practices and policies, wrote this essay seems plausible.

35. Roger Williams, ‘Paper’ describing the opinions of Samuel Gorton (1644?)


Manuscript, New York Public Library; in Shepard’s hand. That this fascinating text existed in more than one copy is suggested by the fact that Thomas Prince, who oversaw the printing of parts of the journal in 1747, used a copy that was not in Shepard’s hand. The journal was known to readers in the seventeenth century; Cotton Mather published extracts in the biography he wrote of Shepard for the Magnalia Christi Americana. The full text of the
New York Public Library manuscript is printed in McGiffert, *God’s Plot*.

37. ‘A Declaration of the Governor, Deputy Governor’ (June 1644) Manuscript, Massachusetts Historical Society, printed in *Winthrop Papers*, 4: 467 from a copy in an unidentified handwriting. A response by all but two of the Massachusetts magistrates to the accusation that ‘they intended to bring in an arbitrary government, etc.’ The magistrates shared the text with the deputies, whereupon the two groups agreed that it should ‘not be published’ (i.e., distributed outside the General Court) lest it fan the flames of factionalism. Winthrop, *Journal*, 514–15.


39. John Allin, ‘The Voice of the Colony against Parliament’ (1646/47) No copy seems to survive of this text by John Allin, minister in Dedham. Arising out of the protest initiated by Dr. Robert Child and a few others in 1646, and presumably a defense of the colonists’ position on the authority of Parliament; Child and his allies had threatened to inform Parliament that English immigrants were being denied their customary rights. *The Record of Baptisms, Marriages and Deaths . . . in the Town of Dedham, Massachusetts, 1638–1845*, ed. Don Gleason Hill (Dedham, Mass., 1888), xii.

Ancient men that came out of Holland and old England Anno dom 1648' (1648)

Manuscript, Plymouth Church Records, Pilgrim Hall, Plymouth, Massachusetts, in Nathaniel Morton's handwriting. 'I haue lately mett with a plaine Well Composed and usefull dialogue; Penend by that honored Pateren of Piety William Bradford Esqr: \ . . . In the Transcribing whereof I haue taken the best Care I Could to preuent offence and to procure acceptance if any good Comes thereof lett God haue all the praise.' Printed in Plymouth Church Records, 2 vols., Publications of the Colonial Society of Massachusetts 22 and 23 (Boston, The Society, 1920), 114–41.

41. Jonathan Mitchell's letter to his brother (1649)

A letter of spiritual counsel written by Mitchell during his years as a tutor at Harvard College (1647–1650). Known from the printed versions, the earliest of these appearing at the end (separately paginated) of Mitchell, A Discourse of the Glory To which God hath called Believers By Jesus Christ (London, 1677), and reprinted as a separate text several times in the eighteenth century; like other letters of its kind (Hall, Ways of Writing, 41–42), almost certainly circulating in handwritten copies.

42. Mercy (Dudley) Woodbridge, 'An epistle [in verse]' (date unknown, but probably c. 1650)

Manuscript known to the early nineteenth-century anthologist Samuel Kettell. 'The sister of Mrs. Bradstreet, Mrs. Woodbridge, the wife of John Woodbridge, minister at Andover and Newbury, was likewise an adventurer in verse. An epistle which she addressed to her sister upon the subject of her volume, is still extant. The poetry is respectable, but has no striking passages.' Specimens of American Poetry with Critical and Biographical Notices, 2 vols. (Boston, 1829), 1: xxvi–xxviii. Almost certainly circulating within the Dudley family circle, as did her sister and father's verse, as well.
43. Thomas Stoughton, ‘treadse on the Sabbath’ (1651; title supplied)
   No version survives of the text Stoughton ‘delivered’ to the Windsor church or possibly to John Warham, its minister; he also ‘presented to the Court [the Connecticut assembly] some what of this,’ whereupon the Court ‘sent it to the Ministers to answer.’ Stoughton was arguing against the position taken by Ephraim Huit (or Hewett), minister in Windsor, Connecticut, until his death in 1644, as to when the Sabbath begins. Stoughton, a resident of the same town, described a long-running controversy with the town’s ministers and his excommunication from the church in a letter to John Winthrop, Jr. in 1651. *Winthrop Papers*, 6: 113–29; see also *Winthrop Papers* 5: 103–11.

44. Ezekiel Cheever, ‘Postscript of Mr. Cheivers his answer to the Church’ (c. 1650)
   That copies were circulating is evident from an allusion to a ‘postscript of Mr. Cheivers his answer to the Church’ in a letter John Davenport sent John Cotton. *Letters of John Davenport*, ed. Calder, 85. ‘A related text that may also have circulated is ‘The Trial of Cheever before the Church at New Haven,’ printed in *Collections of the Connecticut Historical Society* 1 (1860), 22–51, from a manuscript in the Yale University Library. Ezekiel Cheever was schoolmaster in New Haven when he offended John Davenport and the church, was censured, wrote this ‘answer,’ and soon thereafter moved to Massachusetts, where he resumed his career as a teacher.

45. John Davenport, ‘Life of Cotton’ (mid-1650s?)
   No copy known, but referred to in another manuscript text, the contemporary minister Samuel Whiting’s ‘Concerning the Life of the Famous Mr. Cotton,’ printed in Alexander Young, *Chronicles of the First Planters of the Colony of Massachusetts Bay* (Boston, 1846), 419. Cotton died in 1652.
46. Mrs. Eaton, ‘writeings’ (mid-1650s?)

No copy survives of writings by the wife of the governor of New Haven Colony that were known to some of her contemporaries. Winthrop, Journal, 570; Records of the Colony or Jurisdiction of New Haven, ed. Charles J. Hoadly, 2 vols. (Hartford, 1857–58): 2: 234.

47. ‘The Life & Death of Mr. [Theophilus] Eaton’ (no date; but Eaton died in 1658)

Manuscript known to John Higginson, the minister in Salem who had lived for several years in Connecticut. Writing to Increase Mather on August 22, 1682, Higginson reported having ‘lately received a large & excellent Narrative of the Life & Death of Mr. Eaton, Governor of New Haven, to be added to the rest.’ Collections of the Massachusetts Historical Society, 4th ser. 8 (1868): 282; by ‘the rest’ Higginson meant a collection of lives of New England worthies. A wealthy London merchant and member of the Massachusetts Bay Company, Eaton came to New England in 1637 and, in 1638 participated in the founding of New Haven, serving as governor of that colony until his death in 1658. The authorship of this biography can only be a matter of speculation.

48. ‘A council held at Boston, Sept. 26, 1659, concerning the long, sad, and afflicting controversy between the Rev. Teacher, Mr. Samuel Stone, and the brethren of the church at Hartford, on one part, and the brethren, the withdrawers from said church, on the other part, since the relapse, after the pacification of May 3, 1657’ (1659)

Manuscript, Massachusetts Historical Society. Like other such reports of a council’s recommendations, almost certainly distributed to the contending parties. Printed in Sylvester Judd, History of Hadley (Springfield, 1905), 7–8, using the MHS manuscript. Two other texts thrown up by this dispute were listed in Hall, ‘Scribal Publication,’ 55.
49. Lion Gardiner, ‘In the year 1635 I Lione Gardener. . . . ’ (1660)

Manuscript, Trinity College Library, Trinity College, Hartford, Connecticut; an eighteenth-century copy made by Jonathan Trumbull of Connecticut survives in the Trumbull-Williams Papers, Connecticut Historical Society. The original was printed for the first time as Relation of the Pequot Warres (Hartford, Conn.: Acorn Club, 1901). This narrative of the Pequot war of 1637 by the man who commanded a fort at the mouth of the Connecticut River is prefaced by a letter dated June 12, 1660, from Easthampton to ‘Loving Friends, Robert Chapman and Thomas Hurlburt’ recounting the circumstances that led Gardiner to recall the fighting, specifically their request ‘to consider and call to mind the passages of Gods providence at Seabrooke in or about the time’ of the war. The manuscript passed into the hands of John Winthrop, Jr., who inscribed it with his name, and possibly reached ‘Major [John] Mason’ if Gardiner’s friends followed his counsel and ‘let the Governor and Maior Mason see it’ (pp. 3–4). The Massachusetts Historical Society published the imperfect Trumbull copy in Collections of the Massachusetts Historical Society, 3rd ser., 3 (1833): 136–60.

50. Richard Blinman, ‘An Answeare to divers Rd Elders of New England, respecting their Resolution of Quest. 10th, in their book entitled, A Disputadon Concerning Church members, and their children, in answer to 21 Questions’ (c. 1658?)

Manuscript, American Antiquarian Society. A response to the propositions published initially in handwritten copies of a ministerial assembly that met in Boston in June, 1657. Blinman had been selected by the Connecticut government as one of the colony’s delegates to this meeting. After preaching elsewhere in New England, he settled in New London in 1650, a post he left in 1657 or 1658, when he went to live in New Haven; in 1659 he returned to England. The material features of the manuscript suggest it was intended as copy text for a printer. The tenth question of the twenty-one concerned the status of children of a church
member neither of whose parents were ‘qualified for full communion,’ a question the assembly answered by declaring such children entitled to the sacrament of baptism. Blinman cites (p. 5) another manuscript (not listed in this bibliography), an ‘Essay’ by John Davenport, the minister in New Haven who opposed the assembly’s decision, and described as having ‘been in the hands of some of those Rd Elders long before’ the assembly met. See also Robert G. Pope, The Half-Way Covenant (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1969), 31–32.

51. John Davenport, ‘A Reply to the 7 Propositions Concluded By the Synod, Sitting at Boston, June 10: 1662 in Answear to the first Question, vizt. Whoe are the Subject[s] of Baptisme’ (1662) Manuscript, John Davenport Papers, American Antiquarian Society (in the handwriting of a contemporary copyist); a nineteenth-century copy made by David Pulsifer is in the Henry Martyn Dexter Papers, Beineckes Library, Yale University. Almost certainly a manuscript that circulated within the Massachusetts General Court as it was debating how to respond to the conflicts within the Synod of 1662; in a letter to Davenport dated October 21, 1662, Increase Mather assured him that he had ‘your wridings ... in my hands’ and had given a ‘copy of them’ to the synod. Collections of the Massachusetts Historical Society, 4th ser. 8 (1868): 205. See also Michael G. Hall and William L. Joyce, ‘The Half Way Covenant of 1662: Some New Evidence,’ Proceedings of the American Antiquarian Society 87 (1978): 97–110.

52. John Davenport, ‘A Vindication of the Treatise Entituled Another Essay ... being a Reply to a Defence of the Answer and Arguments of the Synod ... in the year 1662’ (1664) Manuscript, John Davenport Papers, American Antiquarian Society. Carrying on his critique of the baptismal policy adopted in 1662, Davenport had been able to publish Another Essay For Investigation of the Truth (Cambridge, 1663) through the local printers. Here he is responding to critiques of that text.
53. John Davenport (and others), 'Newhavens Case Stated' (1664)

Manuscript, Connecticut State Library, addressed to John Winthrop, Jr., and the Connecticut General Assembly; signed 'from the committee, by order of the Genll Court of Newhaven Colony,' dated March 9, 1663/64. A text expressing opposition to the merger of Connecticut and New Haven colonies that was threatened (and in fact occurred) as a consequence of the charter of 1662 Winthrop had obtained in England. Printed in Records of . . . New Haven, ed. Hoadly, 2: 517–30.

54. Roger Williams, 'Defence of Civill Order and Govrnmnt' (c. 1657)

No copy seems to survive of a text that existed in several copies. Williams wrote it 'in answer to' William Harris's 'Defiance angst' the workings of civil government in Providence. In a letter of 1669 mentioning this text, Williams remarked that he 'wrote out' one copy that he sent to Newport and Portsmouth and another that went to Providence and Warwick. In a letter of 1666 Harris mentioned the same 'booke against (me)... of abought a quire of paper,' adding that Williams had sent a copy to Sir Henry Vane in England. Glenn W. LaFantasie, ed., The Correspondence of Roger Williams, 2 vols. (Hanover and London: Brown University Press/University Press of New England, 1988), 602, 608 n.53.

55. 'Ms. Life of John Wilson.' (late 1660s)

Known to Thomas Hutchinson, but apparently no longer existing; of unknown authorship. Ordained in the Church of England, Wilson emigrated in 1630 and became minister of the Boston church. He died in 1667. Hutchinson drew on it as he was writing the first volume of The History of the Colony and Province of Massachusetts-Bay, the sole source of the story, presumably from this manuscript, of Wilson's haranguing from the bough of a tree the crowd that gathered in Cambridge for the fateful election of May 1637 (p. 54 n.). Possibly known to Cotton Mather, whose
sketch of John Wilson in the *Magnalia Christi America* contains stories about Wilson’s English years that are unusually ample.

56. ‘Mr. Grafton’s story’ (1669)

A ‘Sea-Deliverance’ narrative that came into the hands of Increase Mather, who printed it in *An Essay for the Recording of Illustrious Providences* (Boston, 1684), 20–22. See also *Collections of the Massachusetts Historical Society*, 4th ser., 8 (1868): 282.

57. Daniel Denison, ‘To my Dear Grandchildren John, Daniel, and Martha Denison’ (dated 1672)

Location unknown. A longtime resident of Ipswich and a political figure in the Massachusetts government, Denison arrived in the colony in 1631, settling in Ipswich four years later. His wife was a daughter of Thomas Dudley. Their only son died in 1670, an event that prompted him to write this brief account of the Denison family that begins with his own father. A ‘legacy’ text that concludes by evoking the grandchildren’s baptismal covenant. *New England Historical and Genealogical Register* 46 (1892): 127–32.

58. Habbakuk Glover, ‘an Essay to Discover the Principal causes of the Anger of God against N.E. etc.’ (before 1675?)

Possibly no longer surviving, but its contents can be inferred from Increase Mather’s reply, ‘The substance of several sermons tending to vindicate the truth. Against the Heretical exceptions of Mr. H. G. Together with an Answer unto the Arguments contained in a paper written by him opposing and denying the Meritorious obedience of Christ’ (manuscript, Mather Papers, American Antiquarian Society). Glover, a resident of Rhode Island, had written Mather in December 1675 asking ‘if he could borrow Mather’s ‘answer’ to a treatise that Glover had been sharing with others, and perhaps Mather in particular. This exchange of texts is described in William L. Joyce and Michael G. Hall, ‘Three Manuscripts of Increase Mather,’ *Proceedings of the American Antiquarian Society* 86 (1976): 117–18.
59. George (‘a Christian Indian’), ‘narrative’ (1675?)

A manuscript available to Thomas Hutchinson, who included an excerpt from it in History of... Massachusetts Bay, ed. Mayo, i: 249 n. According to Hutchinson’s note, ‘George, a Christian Indian,’ was ‘taken prisoner in the ambushment of Capt. Hutchinson, &c,’ an event that occurred in early August 1675. The narrative includes remarks by Philip, the sachem of the Pokanokets, after whom ‘King Philip’s War’ was named.

60. ‘A narrative of the whole progress of their proceedings’ (1669–1691)

Manuscript, Stiles Papers, Yale University Library. When a group of First Church Boston members asked for permission to withdraw and form a new congregation that, unlike First, would practice the baptismal policies advocated by the Synod of 1662, a long-lasting controversy broke out when First Church refused to sanction the separation and used its political influence to make things difficult for the group determined to withdraw. Some twenty years later in 1691, Third Church appointed a committee to create a documentary record and narrative history of what had happened. A complete copy of this ‘narrative’ came into the hands of the minister-antiquarian Ezra Stiles. Minus the first page, this manuscript served as copy text for the version printed in Hill, History of Old South, 12–89 (interrupted by Hill’s commentary). The professional scriveners who made the Stiles Papers version also made other copies, for fragments of a second copy were known to nineteenth-century antiquarians. Hill, History of Old South, 12 n.2. As noted in my introduction, the ‘narrative’ preserves twenty-odd other documents—letters, reports of church councils, and petitions—some of which also circulated in handwritten copies. One of these follows.

61. ‘The testimony of many of the Ministers of the gospell in Massachusetts [s] Collony in New England against the scandall given by the present Elders of the first Church of Christ in Boston, by
their fraudulent dealing about the letters sent from the Church in New Haven to the Church in Boston (1669)

Partial mss, Massachusetts Historical Society; a full length version is printed in Hill, History of Old South, 100–2.

62. Quintin Stockwell, ‘his own Captivity and Redemption’ (1677?)

Not located. A resident of Deerfield, Stockwell was captured in September 1677 by Indians coming down from Canada and carried to Quebec; he was ransomed within a year. Increase Mather incorporated the narrative Stockwell wrote of his captivity into An Essay for the Recording of Illustrious Providences, 39–57.

63. William Morse, ‘The testimony of William Morse and his wife which they both saw’ (1680?)

Manuscript, Mather Papers, Prince Collection, Boston Public Library.

A description of strange events happening in and to the house William Morse of Newbury shared with his aged wife Elizabeth and a grandson, John Stiles. Almost certainly, Morse gave a copy to the Essex County Court, which was hearing accusations that Elizabeth engaged in witchcraft. That it was circulating is apparent from a summary version in Increase Mather, An Essay for the Recording of Illustrious Providences, 142–55; Mather noted (p. 142) that ‘After those troubles began, he did by the Advice of Friends write down the particulars of those unusual Accidents. And the Account which he giveth thereof is as followeth.’ Printed from the Boston Public Library copy in Witch-Hunting in Seventeenth-Century New England: A Documentary History, 1638–1692, ed. David D. Hall (Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1991), 251–53.

64. (?) Nash, ‘Large Paper, of Admonitions’ (undated, but late seventeenth century)

Preserved in Cotton Mather, Early Religion, Urged (Boston, 1694), 96–100, where it is described as ‘Left behind him, in the
Hands of his Young Friends.' The genre of pious counsel and meditations written by children or young men and women nearing death, or perhaps prepared by parents or other intermediaries, had become widely popular in Nonconformist circles in England and presumably, as well, among the colonists. Mather put together another such compilation, *A Token for the Children of New England* (Boston, 1700). Mather frequently redacted the texts of this kind that reached him, and was also an unreliable copyist who seems never to have compared his versions with putative originals.

65. William Phips, 'relation' of religious experience, presented to Boston Second Church' (1689/90)

No manuscript copy seems to survive. Phips joined Second Church Boston in 1690. His relation was printed in [Cotton Mather], *Pietas in Patriam* (London, 1697), 28–30.

66. Cotton Mather, 'Brand Plucked out of the Burning being an Account of Mercy Short who was supposed to suffer by Witchcraft 1692' (1692)

Mather Family Papers, Box 6, Folder 6, American Antiquarian Society, in Mather's handwriting, a draft version with interpolations; on the paper cover is written, 'To be returned unto Cotton Mather.' Documenting Mather's attempts to heal a young woman; and undoubtedly shared with a discrete circle of readers. Printed in George Lincoln Burr, *Narratives of the Witchcraft Cases* (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1914), 253–87.

67. Cotton Mather, 'Another Brand Pluckt out of the Burning' (1693/94)

Manuscript, Massachusetts Historical Society. Mather's account of the possession of Margaret Rule and his attempts to cure her. Addressed to a 'J. P.,' probably Mather's father-in-law John Phillips. A copy came into the hands of Robert Calef, who incorporated it into *More Wonders of the Invisible World* (London, 1700), 1–13. The history of the manuscript is narrated more fully in

68. Nathaniel Cary, ‘I having heard . . . that my wife was accused of Witchcraft’ (1693?)

Manuscript, possibly not surviving; printed in Calef, More Wonders, 95–98. Cary went to Salem Village in late May 1692 to talk with ministers and magistrates about his wife, whose name had been mentioned by the group of ‘afflicted’ children and young women. Once she was formally accused, Cary obtained a habeas corpus that allowed him to transfer her from the jail in Boston to the one in Cambridge. Thereafter he arranged for her to escape to Rhode Island and, shortly thereafter, to find refuge in New York. He narrated these events in this text.

69. Gershom Bulkeley, ‘Will and Doom, Or the Miseries of Connecticut by and under an Usurped and Arbitrary Power’ (1692)

Manuscript, Public Record Office, recorded in Calendar of State Papers, Colonial Series, America and West Indies, 1704–1705, ed. Cecil Headlam (London, 1916), #644; the preface is signed ‘Philanax, Dec. 12, 1692.’ A nineteenth-century copy made for Henry Stevens, the London-based bookseller, became the copy text for the version printed in Collections of the Connecticut Historical Society 3 (1895): 81–269. A political conservative (royalist) who defended the Dominion of New England and denounced the charter government of Connecticut in two books printed in New York as well as in this manuscript, Bulkeley seems to have sent a copy to Lord Cornbury, who arrived in the colonies in 1702 as governor of the province of New York. Cornbury forwarded the copy now in London.

70. John Higginson, ‘My last words to my children’ (May 1705)

Manuscript known to the Salem antiquarian and minister Charles W. Upham, who quoted from it in ‘Higginson Letters,’
Higginson began by recalling his arrival at Salem in 1629 and admission to the newly founded church, concluding (as quoted by Upham), ‘Amongst other good books, I desire you to read often, my little book of *making peace with God*. It contains the substance of all saving truth; and so the grace of our Lord Jesus Christ be with you all. Amen. Your dying father, John Higginson.’ He would live until 1708.